

Brigadier General John P. Hatch

Library of Congress

Despite Franklin's limited action, Burnside managed to win the heights above Turner's Gap with Hooker's I Corps and win Fox's Gap with Reno's IX. D. H. Hill's tenacious resistance in the morning and the additional troops poured in by Longstreet that afternoon had allowed Lee to barely hold on at nightfall and prevent the fall of the northern passes during the daylight hours.⁶²

The battle of South Mountain did not turn out exactly the way General McClellan had planned it. However, the breaching of the passes prevented a Confederate incursion farther north into Pennsylvania and seized the initiative. Sometime before 8:00 p.m. on the evening of September 14, a hastily arranged gathering occurred on the outskirts of Boonsboro that included Longstreet, D. H. Hill, and Brig. Gen. John B. Hood (fresh from the engagement at Fox's Gap). Lee said little except to ask those present "the prospects for continuing the fight."

Their replies were not reassuring. The enemy held commanding positions on both flanks of Turner's Gap. "On our left a commanding hill was lost before night," wrote D. H. Hill, "Batteries placed upon it next morning, acting in concert with the heavy batteries placed on our right . . . would have made any position untenable on the pike or the crest of the mountain." Longstreet agreed: "The enemy was in great force with commanding positions on both flanks, which would give a cross-fire for his batteries . . . making the cramped position of the Confederates at the Mountain House [Turner's Gap] untenable." Longstreet personally confirmed the situation while riding to join Hill, when he "discovered everything . . . in such disjointed condition that it would be impossible for my troops and Hill's to hold the mountain against such forces as McClellan had there." Hood agreed: "After a long debate, it was decided to

62 Five men, ranking from private to brigadier general, were awarded the Medal of Honor for their actions at South Mountain. Crampton's Gap: Pvt. James Allen, 16th NY, and Lt. George W. Hooker, 4th VT; Fox's Gap: Pvt. Orlando Caruana, 51st NY; Cpl. Leonidas H. Inscho, 12th Ohio; Turner's Gap: Brig. Gen. John P. Hatch. See Dave Roth, "Heroics on South Mountain," *B&G* (Dec-Jan, 1986-87), 4:53.